

"All Data in the Amateur Radio Service must be open and capable of being readily monitored Over the Air for true meaning by third parties. No obscured messages are allowed."

FALSE, misleading and even a misquote: While we all agree that Data in Amateur Radio must be open, multiple systems (FLDGI/FLARQ, D-RATS (proven) and likely others (proofs in progress)) cannot be readily monitored over the air for true meaning by third parties in ARQ/compressed modes. This has been true for many years. These systems DO meet the actual requirement because they are not encoded " for the purpose of obscuring their meaning."

"ACDS Stations interfere and provide obscured messages. The Winlink system/SW is run by ARSFI in the Amateur Radio Service, but also in government frequencies, and is a unique problem."

FALSE. Original studies showed negligible problem for 97.221(C); original development of software reads WINLINK pactor easily; and multiple other systems have now been shown to be LESS READABLE.

"ARSFI/Winlink refuses to adopt standard signaling codes as stipulated in Sec. 97.309, and relies on automatic-request-query (ARQ) and dynamic compression to provide obscured messages in the Amateur Radio Service. Even if certain protocols are "claimed" to be published, the implementation of Winlink's ARQ/adaptive compression with its data modes makes it virtually impossible for 3rd parties to intercept messages for meaning (See: McVey, Rappaport). (Sec. 97.309, Sec. 97.113). "

FALSE – disproven now with multiple examples Interception Software "for meaning" is *free*. The Commission can easily read PACTOR using PMON and WINLINK using *free software*, to verify this. **Actually, it is OTHER systems which currently cannot be monitored, not discussed by the complainant.**

"ARSFI/Winlink does not provide transparency to its global email system queue, and does not allow amateur operators to review emails or files before they are sent over amateur radio stations (Sec. 97.219, 97.105)."

Partially False and Quite Misleading: Every amateur sees messages they are entering; Operators who have expressly allowed messages from defined contacts know who is allowed utilize their privileges.

"The Winlink system carries email from/to the general public over amateur radio spectrum without oversight or prior review of messages for appropriate content. Self Policing is not possible (See EB complaint ticket #3184322)."

FALSE: Specific operators allow specific addresses to contact them using their specific privileges -- NOT the general public as alleged. Self Policing is WILDLY successful as shown by original research, *far beyond any other portion of Amateur Radio*

"Statements by modem vendors such as SCS make clear that their protocols are proprietary, and unlike other proprietary protocols such as D-STAR, AMBE, DMR and Fusion, Winlink/ARSFI and its data modes do not offer a readily available decoding solution for over-the-air monitoring for true meaning. This is in contrast to other HF data modes in the Amateur Radio Service, thus providing an expectation of privacy that leads to violations of the intent and purpose of amateur radio."

FALSE -- Anyone who can type "PMON" knows that Pactor Dragon modems read any PACTOR out there. [Clover/G-TOR] are proprietary - and serve as EXAMPLES of approved techniques. Anyone who has loaded our free software already knows that WINLINK Pactor can be read right off the air (and if minor links were created for other techniques they would be also)

"ARSFI/Winlink also violates ARRL's own interpretation of Sec. 97.309(a)4 requiring documentation to: (a) recognize the technique or protocol when observed on the air, (b) determine call signs of stations in communication and read the content of the transmissions."

FALSE -- Anyone who has an ear can recognize PACTOR, anyone with a DRAGON and can type PMON *can read everything*; anyone with ANY pactor modem **can read the callsigns; anyone who can copy CW can likely read the callsigns.**

"In the ARSFI/Winlink global email system, transmissions cannot be decoded for true meaning over the air by third parties. ARSFI/Winlink data modes employ dynamic compression with ARQ which obscures messages and provides expectations of privacy with documented violations and decades of opposition. This would be prohibited through adoption of RM-11831. "

FALSE -- one need only load free software. Multiple examples already published. The Commission can easily use the free software to verify the falseness of this amazing assertion so many weeks after the software was announced

Lets Review eight TRUE Statements:

1. Amateur radio communications should be readable for persons with adequate signal and appropriate hardware and software. (The long-standing understanding.)
2. The software for FLDGI/FLMSG and D-RATS monitoring *does not yet exist*. (Challenge: Read Appendix 5 and Appendix 7)
3. The software to monitor PAT (FD protocol) and FBB *likely does not exist* (proofs in progress)
4. The complainant neglects to mention any of that.
5. WINLINK is more readable than many in its class.
6. **PACTOR is completely readable, and *always has been* (HOSTMODE)**
7. Even some of the EXAMPLES chosen by the FCC **were proprietary, as are many of the hardware and software in Amateur Radio.**
8. WINLINK is now the **most self-policed, most-compliant and only objectively documented system of all of Amateur Radio.** No such data exist for RTTY, SSB, CW, or FM techniques.